

Contents

Project Guidelines and Requirements	1
Criteria For Assessment Project.....	2
Sample of Some Project Parts.....	4
Materials for Sample Project	6
Interschool Memo.....	7
Hot Lunch Menu	8
Food Guide Pyramid for Young Children	9
Food Guide Pyramid.....	10
The Pyramid Guide to Daily Food Choices.....	11
Making Sense of Portion Sizes	12
Seven Ways to Size up your Servings.....	14
Rubric: Nutrition Brochure.....	16
Group Processing Rubric.....	18
Part 1 Project – Articulating Standards and Task.....	19
Part 1 Project Rubric	20
Part 2 Project Development of Rubrics.....	22
Part 2 Project Rubric	23
Assessment Project Organization	24
Assessment Project Evaluation.....	25
Critique Guidelines.....	27
Rubric for Critique.....	28
APA Style for Citation used in Critique	29
Sample Critique.....	30
Permission to use forms	31

Project Guidelines and Requirements

Guidelines

1. AUDIENCE: For our class purposes the audience is us and a colleague in your school whom you may want to share. Otherwise, your ultimate audience is the class for whom this is designed.
2. SCOPE: Examples: At the secondary level, develop a comprehensive assessment plan for a one semester course, or at least one or two units within a course. At the elementary level develop a comprehensive assessment plan for a content area for a semester. Or, for either level, develop or revise a certain type of assessment throughout the year's curriculum.

Requirements

Create a project that accomplishes one of the following:

- A. development of a set of authentic assessments for a particular course or
- B. a particular content area or
- C. redesign of current assessment to incorporate principles of authentic assessment or
- D. organization and further development of current authentic/performance-based assessments or
- E. development of any other product that demonstrates the implementation of course concept toward a performance-based assessment program.

and includes all of the following:

1. STANDARDS

Identify the content and process standards your authentic/performance-based assessments address. These can come directly from the Illinois Learning Standards, your district standards (outcomes), or standards you have established as key to student learning.

2. TASKS

Develop specific tasks that allow your students to demonstrate that they have met the standards. Typically, a task is something that would take more than one day to complete. You will be creating three authentic/performance-based tasks

3. CRITERIA

Develop specific criteria your students must meet to indicate successful completion of the tasks. (To determine ask yourself – “What does good performance on this task look like?” or “How will I know students have done a good job on the task?")

4. RUBRICS

Develop rubrics to translate your students' performance on the criteria into an evaluation.

5. ORGANIZATION

Organize the assessments into a coherent package that meets the standards you selected for your students. Guidelines follow.

6. WRITTEN PRESENTATION

Produce a clearly presented product that is well written and user-friendly.

7. PERMISSION TO USE (optional)

Attach a permission to use form (see end of this packet)

Criteria for Assessment Project

A. Standards

Criteria For Standards

1. Content standards - a good content standard
 - a. is stated as competencies to be demonstrated (e.g., "write a persuasive letter" versus "understand elements of persuasion."); states meanings of operations and how they relate to one another)
 - b. includes comprehensive coverage of material
 - c. identifies discrete competencies as opposed to generalizations (e.g., "identify a mathematical procedure to obtain information" versus "think mathematically")
2. Process standards - a good process standard
 - a. is stated as competencies to be demonstrated (e.g., "assess progress in one's portfolio" versus "acquire self-reflection skills"; compute fluently and make reasonable estimates)
 - b. involves selecting process skills that you believe are meaningful to your subject matter
 - c. is well integrated with the content standard

B. Tasks

Criteria For A Good Authentic Task

<u>Essential</u> (Required)	<u>Common</u> (Optional)
Is meaningful/reflects real life	Is collaborative
Is performance or product based	Is interdisciplinary/integrated
Taps complex thinking	Is personalized/individualized
Is long-term	Involves peer assessment
Is outcome-driven	
Is student-centered	
-actively engages students	
-involves self-assessment	
-involves student choice	
Involves open assessment	
Includes multiple indicators	
Is linked to instruction	
Involves multiple avenues of approach	

C. Criteria

Criteria For Criteria: A Good Set Of Criteria

1. communicates clearly expectations of successful work
2. covers all essential elements of successful performance
3. is stated in observable terms
4. uses age-appropriate vocabulary so that students can self-assess

D. Rubrics**Criteria For Rubrics: A Good Rubric**

1. clearly identifies weights assigned to criteria
2. has consistent wording across categories
3. is stated in observable terms
4. emphasizes high standards
5. clearly identifies type of scoring
6. effectively spreads categories across a continuum
7. is appropriate for the criteria
8. is appropriate for the task
9. uses age-appropriate vocabulary so that students can self-assess

E. Organization**Criteria For Organization:**

A well-organized package of assessments

1. adequately covers the standards
2. effectively connects the different tasks, criteria and rubrics
3. is manageable on a day-to-day basis as well as year/semester long
4. allows the teacher, students and parents to clearly understand their role in the process
5. describes how these different assessments will be integrated into a grade or final evaluation
6. takes into consideration actions to enhance reliability and validity

F. Written Presentation**Criteria For Presentation:**

An effective presentation of the project

1. is well-organized
2. is clearly stated
3. is free of mechanical errors
4. is well laid-out so that other readers can easily understand the contents

Sample of Some Project Parts

Unit on Nutrition (Based on a project exemplar submitted by J. Mitchell, with permission)

Fourth Grade

Standards for the Unit (observable and measurable) (These come from the Illinois Learning Standards, You can also address District Standards [outcomes] or teacher created standards)

Locate, organize, and use information from various sources to answer questions, solve problems, and communicate ideas.

Apply acquired information, concepts, and ideas to communicate in a variety of formats.

Analyze and evaluate information acquired from various sources.

Speak effectively using language appropriate to the situation and audience.

Explain the effects of health-related actions on the body systems.

Describe factors that affect growth and development.

Compose well-organized and coherent writing for specific purposes and audiences.

Communicate ideas in writing to accomplish a variety of purposes.

Performance based assessment tasks in unit (You will minimally need three tasks for your unit)

Task #1: Critique of The School's Hot Lunch Menu

Task #2: Self-Evaluation of Current Eating Habits

Task #3: Creating a Nutrition Brochure

Task #3 Creating a Nutrition Brochure

Description of Task #3

Students will receive a memo from the head of the school lunch program, Mr. Bendix. He has asked the students to create a brochure for each of the classrooms that will help students make healthy choices about what to eat each day. He has enclosed a typical weekly menu of what is served in the cafeteria. Once completed, the brochures will be duplicated by Mr. Bendix office and distributed throughout the building.

It is anticipated that students will need a week to a week and a half to complete this task. The time may look like this: Day 1 groups, project overview, and food pyramid review, Day 2 research, Day 3 research, Day 4 create draft of brochure, Day 5 create draft of brochure, Day 6 critique peer brochure, and Day 7 make changes to brochure.

Procedures for Task #3

Students will work in cooperative groups comprised of three students. They will investigate the food pyramid for children and adults to determine (a) types of foods in each area of the food pyramid, (b) obtain nutritional information on each area, and (c) obtain information on the daily recommended amounts for each area. Students will also research facts that tell how eating healthily affects the body.

Once the above research is completed students will develop a week's worth of healthy lunches and after school snack option. Students will then brainstorm ideas of how to complete their three-panel brochure. They will create a rough draft prototype to be critiqued in peer groups. Then they will create their finished/revised brochure.

Teacher's role (List the main things the teacher needs to do in order for this task to be successful)

- Create the cooperative groups
- Share memo
- Review the food pyramid and nutrition
- Provide example brochures for students to look through for ideas
- Meet with groups regularly to monitor progress
- Meet with groups to discuss critique results
- Evaluate the groups on their brochure and on ability to work together
- Display brochures and copy and distribute to grade levels

Students' role (List the main things students need to do in order for this task to be successful)

- Read memo
- Review and share prior knowledge about the food pyramid and nutrition
- Find facts on how eating a balanced diet affects the body
- Create lunch menus and healthy snack menus
- Create draft of brochure
- Read criteria for critique of peer draft
- Critique another group's draft and discuss it with them.
- Create the final/revised brochure for their group
- Present brochure to classmates
- Evaluate his/her group's efforts

Criteria for Task #3 (To determine these, ask yourself – “What does good performance on this task look like?” or “How will I know students have done a good job on the task.)

- Provide information on each area of the USDA's MyPlate.
- Articulate nutritional information related to fats, carbohydrates, protein, calories, and vitamins
- Articulate recommended daily amounts
- Write a week worth of balanced lunches and after-school snacks.
- Write how to figure out portions
- Write about the benefits of healthy eating
- Organize the brochure to communicate information to students in the school

Materials for Task #3 (See next few pages)

- Interschool Memo
- Rubric for Brochure
- Group Process Rubric
- Food pyramid information
- Items for portions: measuring cups, tennis ball, CD, web resources, cotton balls, dominoes, dice, bar of soap, ping-pong ball

Materials for Sample Unit on Nutrition

Interschool Memo

To: Ms. Cook's Class
From: Mr. Bendix, Head of Food Services
Date: March 29
Re: The USDA's MyPlate Brochures

Dear Ms. Cook's class,

I have been noticing that many of our students do not bring healthy lunches or eating all the healthy food on the lunch tray. I am concerned because it is important to eat a healthy diet in order to be healthy and get through a busy school day learning as much as each of you can.

I know that your class has been studying nutrition, the food pyramid, and the effects that eating healthy foods has on your bodies. Since you have learned so much I would like your class to create a brochure that would teach the rest of the school about USDA's MyPlate and healthy eating. I would like to distribute your brochures throughout the schools so that students can learn about the food pyramid, what foods our bodies need, and how much food we need each day.

Please let me know by the end of the week if your class would be willing to take on this very important task.

Sincerely,

Mr. William Bendix

Mr. William Bendix
Head of Food Services

School's Hot Lunch Menu

MONDAY	TUESDAY	WEDNESDAY	THURSDAY	FRIDAY
1 Chicken Nuggets French Fries, Mixed Veggies Frozen Fruit Juicer	2 Baked ham Mashed Potato Peas Applesauce	3 Juice Stuffed Crust pizza, Corn, Fresh Apple	4 Steak-um Sandwich French Fries Green Beans Pears w/Syrup	5 Tuna Sandwich Potato chips Veggie sticks Sugar cookie
8 Juice Beef Stew Raised Roll Fresh Fruit	9 Baked Manicotti w/cheese & sauce Raised roll Green Beans Ice cream cup	10 Hamburger w/roll French Fries Peas Fruit Juicer	11 Chicken Noodle Soup Baked Pretzel Cheese stick Fresh Apple	12 Fish Patty w/roll French Fries Mixed Veggies Fruit Snacks
15 Chicken Nuggets French Fries Peas Fruit Juicer	16 Chop Suey w/beef Breadstick Green beans Fruit snacks	17 Juice Chicken Pocket Pie Raised Roll Fresh Apple	18 Juice French Toast Sausage Links Orange Wedges	19 Grilled Cheese Sandwich Tomato Soup Saltine crackers Fresh Grapes
22 Beef Ravioli Raised Roll Green Beans Fruit Juicer	23 Hotdog w/roll Potato Chips Carrot Sticks Fresh Apple	24 Chicken salad roll Potato chips Veggie sticks w/dip Cookie	25 Roast Turkey Mashed Potato Peas Raised Roll Sherbet Cup	26 Fish sticks French Fries Mixed veggies Chocolate Cake
29 Chicken Nuggets French Fries Peas Fruit Snacks	30 Sloppy Joes Buttered Pasta Green Beans Fresh Orange	31 Chicken Patty w/roll French fries Mixed veggies Ice cream cup	Apr. 1 French Bread Pizza Corn Fruit juicee	2 Tuna Sandwich Potato Chips Veggies Sticks Apple Crisp

Rubric: Nutrition Brochure

Names: _____

Date: _____

Content

4	3	2	1
Identified 5 or more types of food eaten in each area of the food pyramid.	Identified 3-4 types of food eaten in each area of the food pyramid.	Identified 1-2 types of food eaten in each area of the food pyramid.	Did not identify food eaten in each portion of the food pyramid.
All nutritional values correctly listed for each area of the food pyramid.	Most nutritional values correctly listed for each area of the food pyramid.	Few nutritional values correctly listed for each area of the food pyramid.	No nutritional values listed for each area of the food pyramid; no values listed were correct
Portions and servings accurately communicated	Most portions and servings accurately communicated.	Some portions and servings accurately communicated.	Most portions and servings not accurately communicated; no portions mentioned
Four facts about the importance of eating healthy included	Three facts about the importance of eating healthy included	Two facts about the importance of eating healthy included	1 or no facts about the importance of eating healthy included
Ten (5 lunch and 5 snacks) menus in line with the pyramid guidelines	6-9 menus in line with the pyramid guidelines	1-5 menus in line with the pyramid guidelines	Menus do not meet guidelines; no menus created

Writing

4	3	2	1
Communicates effectively; conveys clear, focused main ideas supported by well-chosen details and examples.	Communicates completely; conveys clear, focused main ideas supported by relevant details and examples.	Communicates partially; conveys main ideas but does not support effectively	Communicates in a limited manner. Does not present or support main ideas.
All of the writing is done in complete sentences. Capitalization and punctuation are correct throughout the brochure.	Most of the writing is done in complete sentences. Most of the capitalization and punctuation are correct throughout the brochure.	Some of the writing is done in complete sentences. Some of the capitalization and punctuation are correct throughout the brochure.	Most of the writing is not done in complete sentences. Most of the capitalization and punctuation are not correct throughout the brochure.

Brochure

4	3	2	1
Brochure well arranged.	Brochure is arranged.	Brochure is poorly arranged.	Brochure is not arranged.
The graphics/pictures go well with the text and there is a good mix of text and graphics	The graphics go well with the text, but there are so many that they distract from the text	The graphics go well with the text, but there are too few	The graphics do not go with the text or appear to be randomly chosen; no graphics used

Comments _____

Total Score _____ /45

Group Processing Rubric

Title of Project: U_____

Date _____

Group Members:

We each completed our assigned roles. Always Sometimes Never

We shared ideas Always Sometimes Never

We listened to each other. Always Sometimes Never

We helped each other use the computer
to create our project. Always Sometimes Never

We praised each other and encouraged
each other. Always Sometimes Never

Our group could have done better by _____

Our goal for next time is to _____

so, we can be the best we can be!

Part 1 Project: Articulating Standards and Task

The purpose of Part 1 Project is to provide an opportunity for you to think through and state what your unit's purpose is in the learning process. As a result, one of the authentic/performance-based assessment tasks related to this unit (and the final course project) will be designed.

Your Part 1 Project will address the following areas:

A. Description of the unit

Describe and list what content and skills are covered in the unit?

To what extent are the content and skills new to students?

Describe what assignments, projects, and or tests you currently use in this unit?

What authentic/performance-based assessment tasks have you determined will fit this unit?

How would developing authentic/performance-based assessment tasks change the unit?

B. Briefly describe the three tasks that you are going to create for this unit.

C. Choose one of your three tasks that you listed in part B and fully respond by addressing these areas
see example on pages 4-18 of this packet:

- Standards met by the task – include content and process standards
- Describe the task
 - What are the students being asked to do?
 - What time will be needed to successfully complete the task?
 - Write out the procedures for accomplishing the task
 - Teacher's role delineated
 - Students' role delineated
 - Criteria for the task listed
 - Materials needed for the task –attach any paper-based items that you would hand out to students as attached PDFs. Otherwise provide a URL for internet-based materials.

DO NOT WORK ON RUBRICS FOR THE PART 1 PROJECT ASSIGNMENT

Part 1 Project Rubric

Description of the Unit			
4	3	2	1/0
All areas addressed thoroughly	Most areas addressed; all areas addressed	Some areas addressed; lacks details	Undeveloped; most areas not addressed
Outcomes and Standards			
4	3	2	1/0
All content and process outcomes state as discrete competencies, meaningful to subject/instruction; standards clearly identified	Most outcomes have met criteria; standards identified	Inconsistency of outcome criteria; standards identified	Undeveloped outcomes; standards not identified
Tasks			
4	3	2	1/0
Clearly relate to the stated standards	Relationship to content noted	Inconsistent relationship	Limited relationship
Exceptionally usable, clearly stated task description and roles	Both roles and task identified clearly	Some lack of clarity/lack of detail	Roles unstated or task un-described
Task actively engages students, involves self-assessment, and provides for student choice	Most of the task actively engages students, involves self-assessment, and provides for student choice	Limited active engagement, self-assessment, and/or student choice	Task heavily teacher centered; Lacks important areas of student-centeredness
Task require students to apply complex thinking skills	Students must use thinking skills	Limited use of thinking skills	Lower-level skills required
		Time sufficient to complete the task	Time insufficient to complete the task
Criteria			
	3	2	1/0
	Effectively communicates clear expectations for successful work	Mostly communicates clear expectation for successful work	Expectations unclear or confusing
	All essential elements of successful performance listed	Most elements of successful performance listed	Critical areas of successful performance missing
	All stated in observable terms	Most stated in observable terms	Not stated in observable terms
	Uses age-appropriate vocabulary so that students can self-assess	Mostly in age-appropriate language so students can self assess	Language too sophisticated for the age group

Materials			
4	3	2	1/0
	All essential materials present	Most essential materials present	Lacking most; no materials attached
		Black-line masters and/or internet – sources cited	Black-line masters and/or internet – source not cited
Written Presentation			
4	3	2	1/0
Project typed; pages numbered; assembled appropriately; free of grammatical and spelling errors	Project typed; pages numbered, somewhat organized; few grammatical and spelling errors	Project typed; lacks organization; several grammatical and spelling errors	Poorly presented; numerous errors

Part 2 Project: Development Of Rubrics For The Task Developed In Part 1 Project

Using the task that was developed in the Part 1 Project, you will develop the following items:

- A. One rubric that evaluates the task (holistic or analytic)
- B. One rubric that allows students to self evaluate their efforts on the task or some aspect of the task (holistic, analytic, and/or checklist).

What you turn in:

1. Copy and paste from the Part 1 Project these areas
 - o Standards met by the task – include content and process standards
 - o Description of the task
 - What are the students being asked to do?
 - Procedures for accomplishing the task
 - Criteria for the task listed
2. Rubric 1 and 2 appropriately titled and an explanation of why you designed the rubrics as you have. In your remarks be sure to address how the rubric will be useful to students as they engage in the task and to you as the evaluator.

Part 2 Project Rubric

Project Specifications			
	3	1	0
	Followed the directions and included all items and narratives	Most areas addressed	Most areas not addressed; did not follow directions
Rubrics			
5	3	1	0
		Clearly identifies type of scoring	Scoring procedures used unclear
Criteria clearly states high expectation of achievement standards in observable terms	Criteria clear, but higher expectations and/or observable terms needed	Criteria limited in all categories	Criteria unclear
Indicators chosen align with and clarify criteria and tasks	Frequent observation of criteria	Inconsistent observation of criteria	Indicators distract
Consistent and appropriate wording used across the continuum	Wording somewhat consistent	Wording varies	Wording distracts
Scoring clearly identified; indication of final evaluation	Scoring clearly identified some reference to evaluation	Scoring and evaluation limited/unclear	Scoring omitted
	Uses age-appropriate vocabulary so that students can self-assess	Mostly in age-appropriate language so students can self assess	Language too sophisticated for the age group
		Appropriate for the task	Not appropriate for the task
Written Presentation			
5	3	1	0
Project typed; pages numbered; assembled appropriately; free of grammatical and spelling errors	Project typed; pages numbered, somewhat organized; few grammatical and spelling errors	Project typed; lacks organization; several grammatical and spelling errors	Poorly presented; numerous errors

Assessment Project Organization

- ✓ Cover page – to include
 - Title of project (approximately a third down from the top)
 - Your name (Start approximately a third up from the bottom)
 - Course number and title
 - Date
 - Instructor's name
 - [Name of Institution]

- ✓ Table of contents

- ✓ Introduction – This provides information about the environment in which the project will be implemented
 - describe the district, building, classroom/grade level, students
 - explain why you selected this particular unit to modify
 - explain how you will inform students, parents, and colleagues

- ✓ Tasks – there will be three authentic/performance-based tasks. In each of the these, address:
 - State Standard(s) or District Standards(s) (outcomes) met by the task
 - List the materials needed to accomplish the task (for teacher and students)
 - Description of the assessment task
 - Teacher's role
 - Students' role
 - Criteria – develop the specific criteria students must meet to indicate successful completion of the task. (To determine ask yourself – “What does good performance on this task look like?” or “How will I know students have done a good job on the task.)
 - Materials to accompany the task
 - Rubrics
 - Group evaluations
 - Memos
 - Student task description sheet(s)
 - Other feedback sheets
 - Other

Are We What We Eat?
A Unit on Nutrition

Terri Cook
[Course number and name]
Strategies for the Classroom
June 1
[Name of Instructor]

Assessment Project Evaluation

Introduction				
4	3	2	1	X1
All areas addressed	Categories of information provided in less depth limiting use or review of the project	Some information in less depth and categories omitted	Lacks information requested	
Outcomes and Standards				
4	3	2	1	X2
All content and process outcomes state as discrete competencies, meaningful to subject/instruction ; standards clearly identified	Most outcomes have met criteria; standards identified	Inconsistency of outcome criteria; standards identified	Undeveloped outcomes; standards not identified	
Tasks				
4	3	2	1	X3
Clearly relate to the stated outcomes/objectives	Relationship to content noted	Inconsistent relationship	Limited relationship	
Multiple quality approaches such as cooperative learning, self-assessment, use of technology, dyads etc.	Several approaches with quality	Minimal quality and quantity	Lacked multiple approaches	
Task actively engages students, involves self-assessment, and provides for student choice	Most of the task actively engages students, involves self-assessment, and provides for student choice	Limited active engagement, self-assessment, and/or student choice	Task heavily teacher centered; Lacks important areas of student-centeredness	
Exceptionally usable, clearly stated task descriptions and roles	Both roles and task identified clearly	Some lack of clarity/lack of detail	Roles unstated or tasks un-described	

Tasks require students to apply complex thinking skills	Students must use thinking skills;	Limited use of thinking skills	Lower-level skills required	
		Time sufficient to complete the task	Time insufficient to complete the task	

Criteria				
	3	2	1	X3
	Effectively communicates clear expectations for successful work	Mostly communicates clear expectation for successful work	Expectations unclear or confusing	
	All essential elements of successful performance listed	Most elements of successful performance listed	Critical areas of successful performance missing	
		Stated in observable terms	Not stated in observable terms	
	Uses age-appropriate vocabulary so that students can self-assess	Mostly in age-appropriate language so students can self assess	Language too sophisticated for the age group	
Materials				
	3	2	1/0	X1
	All essential materials included	Most essential materials included	Lacking most materials; no materials attached	
		Material sources cited	Material sources not cited	
Rubrics				
4	3	2	1	X3
Criteria clearly states high expectation of achievement standards in observable terms	Criteria clear, but higher expectations and/or observable terms needed	Criteria limited in all categories	Criteria unclear	
Indicators chosen align with and clarify criteria and tasks	Frequent observation of criteria	Inconsistent observation of criteria	Indicators distract	

Consistent and appropriate wording used across the continuum	Wording somewhat consistent	Wording varies	Wording distracts	
Scoring clearly identified; indication of final evaluation	Scoring clearly identified some reference to evaluation	Scoring and evaluation limited/unclear	Scoring omitted	
Written Presentation				
4	3	2	1	X1
Project typed; pages numbered; assembled appropriately; free of grammatical and spelling errors	Project typed; pages numbered, somewhat organized; few grammatical and spelling errors	Project typed; lacks organization; several grammatical and spelling errors	Poorly presented; numerous errors	

Critiques

Purpose

The purpose of the critiques is to allow you to explore the literature published in educational journals that address issues of assessment.

You will decide which two topics, listed on the calendar, that interest you the most. You will print out and read an article on the topic, prepare a critique, present information in class on the day the topic is discussed.

Locating Articles

You can use journals you subscribe to or that your school may subscribe to or

You will use the Oesterle Library online resources to locate two articles that address two different topics listed on the course calendar. You can access the Oesterle Library by using this link
http://www.noctrl.edu/library_ncc/articles/subject.shtml#sub4

Format

Your one-page critique (absolutely no more than 2 pages) will address the following:

- The citation of the article using APA Format
- State the main idea/thesis of the article – (address the author's purpose)
- Support section – address the important points the author(s) used to support the main idea/thesis. Use your own words. If you do use a small quote reference the page number.
- Reaction – This is your reaction to the article. Address 2-3 primary reactions you have (may want to address what you learned from the article, what may be missing or what you agree with or disagree with)
- Conclude with an overall reaction to the article

What you turn in

The critique (see sample p. 30 of this packet) and the full article

Rubric For Evaluating Critiques

	4	3	2	1	0
Thesis/Main Idea	Accurate, complete, and concise	Accurate, complete, and/or concise; too wordy	Accurate, but missing key detail(s); too wordy	A few inaccurate aspects of the thesis/main idea	Only a general statement; inaccurate thesis/main idea
Support	Essential, accurate and detailed support	Accurate, but lacking level of detail	Accurate, but missing several key details	A few inaccurate statements; Mostly general statements	Only general and/or inaccurate statements in the support
Reaction	Interesting, thoughtful ideas. Thoughtful reaction that addresses major ideas of the article	Thoughtful ideas; No significant problems with the reaction	Adequate ideas; Some problem with the reaction	Shallow, brief reaction lacking depth of analysis	Only broad statements lacking personal reflection are included
Format of critique	1-2 pages long; Professional appearance (layout, grammar, spelling, mechanics); Proper source documentation in APA style	Professional appearance; Full source documentation ; APA format errors; beyond two pages	Minor problems with appearance; Source documentation incomplete; beyond two pages	Several significant appearance or documentation problems; beyond two pages	Critical errors make the format unacceptable

Adams, K. A. (1985). Gamesmanship for internal evaluators: Knowing when to "hold 'em" and when to "fold 'em". *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 8(1), 53-57.

Thesis/Main Idea

The internal evaluator must be savvy enough to recognize the compromises needed to carry out the evaluation and report the findings. This recognition provides a way to preserve integrity toward self (professional objectivity) and toward the stakeholder groups (organizational loyalty).

Support for Thesis/Main Idea

Internal evaluators appear to have the advantage of easy access to information and key individuals. Yet, there are risks involved. Conflict arises when the evaluator wishes to report all the findings (positive and negative) and the stakeholders view the negative results as damaging. Tactics may be employed to thwart the efforts of the evaluator such as: 1) limiting access to information or to key personnel, or 2) pressure to de-emphasizing the negative results. To truly be astute, an internal evaluator must become a gamesperson, meaning "the subtle art of protecting self organizational, and professional interests without compromising ethical values" (p. 55). Gamesmanship strategies include: (a) reciprocity of self-disclosure, (b) reciprocal favors, (c) establishing and internal support base, (d) maintaining external linkage, and (e) using effective communication skills.

Reaction

My first reaction centered on why anyone would volunteer to be an internal evaluator. (This implies that one really can say no without fear of reprisal.) It seems that after the flattery of being asked wears off, that there is a reality to be faced concerning just how the findings will influence policy making. It seems that an internal evaluator would be in a constant state of understanding, resolving or coexisting with the hidden agendas of the decision makers. This has made me wonder if I could balance the desire to make a difference with the findings and the reality that the findings may not be implemented to bring about needed changes.

Second, I appreciate the value of the five recommendations of gamesmanship. Whether dealing with ethical issues or any other issues these five recommendations represent sound advice. They are at the heart of any change effort. Perhaps, we forget just how often decision making is based on conflict between personal ethics and other ethics such as organization ethics.

Lastly, I was struck by the possibility that the gamesmanship recommendations could be used to manipulate the decision makers. Would stakeholders and decision makers be savvy enough to recognize subtle lobbying on the part of the evaluator?

It seems that I have analyzed an aspect of the ethics issue in which more questions are raised than direction given. Perhaps the function of the analysis is to keep the issue of ethics alive and addressed so that evaluators will be able to reach decisions concerning the evaluation when ethical conflicts appear.

Permission To Use

One of the processes of authentic assessment and performance-based assessment to help students with learning is to have samples of work to be used as exemplars. If you wish to submit your work as a future exemplar please hand in with the appropriate box checked and signed permission to use form attached .

I give permission to have my

- Critique,
- Part 1 Project,
- Part 2 Project,
- Assessment Project

used as a course exemplar

Signature

Date _____